

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: East Area
Date: 14 June 2007

Ward: Clifton
Parish: Clifton Planning Panel

Reference: 06/02363/LBC
Application at: Haxby Road County Primary School Haxby Road York YO31 8JN
For: Erection of two single storey extensions and internal alterations to existing school, new covered play area, conversion of outbuildings to cycle stores and replacement ramp
By: Education Committee
Application Type: Listed Building Consent
Target Date: 10 January 2007

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The site lies in Haxby Road County Primary School in Clifton. The school is one of a series of schools designed by the distinguished York architect W H Brierley. It was built in 1903-4 and is listed as grade II. This is a Listed Building Consent application to carry out the following development:

- i. Erection of single storey linked structures. Both structures would be linked by passageways from the side elevations of the existing building,
- ii. Internal alterations to the floor layout of the building,
- iii. Construction of a new covered play area,
- iv. Conversion of outbuildings to cycle stores,
- v. Construction of replacement ramp.
- vi. External alterations to the layout of the site.

1.2 The site area is given as 0.9 hectare.

1.3 Both the northern and the southern structures would measure 9.9m x 6.0m and 13.9m x 7.6m respectively. They would both be construction of a combination of aluminium and glass materials.

1.4 The latest revised scheme submitted shows both structures have moved further back from the front elevation to reveal the set of windows in the side elevations of the listed building. In addition, the higher connecting elements linking the structures with the main building have been removed and have been replaced by 2.6m high aluminium passageways.

1.5 In terms of the internal layout of building, it is proposed to reorganise the use of space within so that part of the school can be used as an "Integrated Children Centre". This would include the rearrangement of internal walls in order to provide:

- i. Adults and children spaces,
- ii. Lobby,
- iii. Consultation and clinical rooms,
- iv. Laundry,
- v. Kitchen,
- vi. Unisex toilets and changing rooms, and
- vii. Kitchenette

1.6 In order to improve access it is proposed to insert a lift and to amend existing ramps.

1.7 A number of alterations have also been proposed to the layout of the site. This include the rearrangement of existing parking and part of the playground areas to provide 15 marked parking bay within the site, rearrangement of pedestrian routes from Haxby Road to the play area to the front of the main building, and erection of fences / enclosures.

1.8 Other development proposed include the construction of a 13.6m x 8.4m soft surface play area to the front of the main building, the construction of a 2.0m high ramp outside the main entrance on the front elevation of the building, and the conversion of a 8.5m x 2.0m outbuilding to staff cycle storage area. A total of 10 Sheffield stands are proposed to be located within the building, which is sited to the rear of the application site. The physical appearance of the outbuilding would not be changed by virtue of the development.

1.9 In relation to the surroundings part of the development would be directly facing a row of terrace houses along White Cross Road to the south. A number of industrial / warehouse units are sited to the north of the site.

1.10 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

1.11 99/02281/LBC: Erection of single storey pitched roof canteen building. This application was withdrawn on 10.11.1999.

1.12 99/02607/LBC: Erection of single storey pitched roof detached kitchen building with link to existing school. This application was withdrawn on 03.02.2003.

1.13 04/02392/LBC: Internal and external alterations. Permission was granted on 17.8.04.

1.14 06/02362/GRG3: Erection of two single storey extensions and internal alterations to existing school, new covered play area, conversion of outbuildings to cycle stores and construction of replacement ramp. This application is under consideration.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams East Area (2) 0005

Listed Buildings Grade 2 Haxby Road School Haxby Road 0291

Schools Haxby Road Primary 0198

2.2 Policies:

CYHE4
Listed Buildings

CYHE2
Development in historic locations

CYGP1
Design

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

INTERNAL:

3.1 Urban Design and Conservation Section: latest response received 17 May 2007 -
The following comments have been made:

- The revised proposals presented presently appear to have addressed earlier concerns raised by the Council's Conservation Officer and English Heritage,
- The new locations of the units and their overall height relative to this substantial building would appear to reduce harm to the setting of the listed building,
- Overall there has been a significant improvement to the appearance of the scheme.
- Conditions recommended.

EXTERNAL

3.2 English Heritage: Latest response received 15 May 2007 - no objections to the principle of the scheme. However it is suggested that access should be gained by means of an openable window or door to the internal courtyard beneath the chimney for cleaning and general maintenance. It is also suggested that high quality materials and detailing will be paramount to the success of the extensions.

3.3 York Civic Trust: Response received 2 January 2007 - the trust objected due to the following reasons:

- it seems inconceivable that elevations for extension on the north and south ends of this building should be proposed with such insensitive designs and materials,
- it would appear that the Government advice has not been observed by the agents dealing with this application,
- the proposal would seriously harm the character and setting of this listed building.

The Trust were re-consulted on 20th April 2007 on the revised scheme. No response received.

3.4 Clifton Planning Panel: Latest response received 23 May 2007 - The panel is pleased with the alterations and therefore has no objections.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 The main issues raised by this application are whether the proposed development would have a detrimental effect on the setting and the original character of the grade II listed building and whether the proposal would result in the loss of the historic fabric of the building.

4.2 Policy HE2 of the City of York Draft Local Plan 2005 states development proposals in locations which affect the setting of listed buildings must respect adjacent buildings, open spaces, landmarks and setting and have regard to local scale, proportion, details and materials. Furthermore the development is required to contribute to the character or appearance of the area.

4.3 In the case of this development, out of a number of works proposed it would appear that the proposed 'pods' (the proposed northern and southern linked structures) would have the most notable impact on the setting and the appearance of this grade II listed building.

4.4 Based on the current thinking that new additions to historic buildings should truly reflect the architectural characteristics of the time they were built, should be subservient to the main building and should be removable and partially detached in order to reduce their harms to the fabric of the historic building, it is considered that the proposed linked structures have fulfilled these criteria and have been designed in a way that would create minimal harm to the fabric of the listed building. Furthermore, the latest revised scheme shows both linked structures have moved further back from the front elevation of the building so that important features of the listed building can still be seen. They would be sited in less prominent positions (to the side of the building) so that the main elevations of the building will not be affected.

4.5 Having taken the above into account, it is regarded that the proposed linked structures would have little detrimental visual impact on the character, the appearance and the setting of the listed building. However, as pointed out by the English Heritage's Historic Buildings Inspector, high quality in both the detailing and the materials will be paramount to the success of the extensions. Therefore these are to be strictly controlled by conditions should planning permission be granted. The latest consultation responses received have confirmed that both the English Heritage and the Council's Urban Design and Conservation Unit have no objections to the proposal subject to conditions.

4.6 Other development proposed, including the proposed play area with covered play canopy above and the proposed replacement ramp are considered to have little detrimental affect on the listed building. It is also not considered that the internal alterations proposed including the insertion of a lift in the former classroom would

detrimentally harm the layout or the fabric of the listed building. No concerns have been raised by the Council's Urban Design and Conservation Section and the English Heritage regarding the proposed internal alterations. This is subject to conditions.

4.7 Under the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990 the Secretary of State is required to be notified if the local planning authority is minded to grant listed building consent on an application submitted by the local authority.

4.8 By virtue of the above it is considered that the proposed development accords with National Planning Policy no.15 and the policies set out in the City of York Local Plan. Hence, this application is recommended for approval.

5.0 CONCLUSION

For the reasons above this application is recommended for approval.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIMEL2

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the following plans:-

0394/20A, 0394/04A, 0394/02, 0394/03B, 0394/06A, 0394/07A, 0394/08, 0394/10 and 0394/16 as received by the City of York Council on 17 April 2007 and on 30 May 2007

or any plans or details subsequently agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority as amendment to the approved plans.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 Prior to the development commencing, the following details shall be submitted and approved in writing by the LPA:

i. Details of the new opening to be formed between the nursery and WC area (where the existing blocked recess is located) and details to show how the dado and plinth would be returned or finished,

ii. Details of the corridor doors and screens including a large scale detail of the abutment of the "milk area" screen with the existing partition,

iii. Full details of the new "pod" units including manufacturers literature. These shall include a 1:20 section and plan through the external wall at solid and glazed panel positions, plinth and verge details, door details, materials,

iv. Large scale details of the abutments of the pod with the walls and doorhead of the existing building,

v. Large scale details of all external works including revised landscape plan, ramps (where existing stonework should be left in place under new ramps), steps, gates, railings and paths,

vi. Details of openings to be made in existing walls, and

vii. Details of the new covered play canopy.

Following such written approval, all the development hereby permitted shall conform to that approved specification.

Reason: To safeguard the character and appearance of the Grade II Listed Building in accordance with Planning Policy Guidance no.15 "Planning and the Historic Environment" and policies HE4, HE2 and GP1 of the City of York Draft Local Plan 2005.

- 4 Notwithstanding any proposed materials specified on the approved drawings or in the application form submitted with the application, samples of the external materials to be used for the construction of the new pods shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be carried out using the approved materials.

Reason: So as to achieve a visually cohesive appearance.

- 5 Prior to the development commencing, details of the means of access to the chimney shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Following such written approval, all the development hereby permitted shall conform to that approved specification.

Reason: In order to ensure the means of access to the chimney is satisfactory.

- 6 All disturbed internal areas must be made good to match their surroundings.

Reason: To safeguard the character and appearance of the Grade II Listed Building in accordance with Planning Policy Guidance no.15 "Planning and the Historic Environment" and policies HE4, HE2 and GP1 of the City of York Draft Local Plan 2005.

7.0 INFORMATIVES: Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the setting and the original character and fabric of the grade II listed building . As such the proposal complies with Policies GP1, HE4 and HE2 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

Contact details:

Author: Billy Wong Development Control Officer
Tel No: 01904 552750